

CIVCAS CELL INITIAL ASSESSMENT

Allegation #	739		
Source(s)	AIRWARS	Date Received	21 JUN 2017
Casualty Estimate	2 killed, 2 or more wounded		
Incident Date	18 NOV 2016		
Location	Tal Afar, Nineveh Province, Iraq IVO (b)(1)1.4a		
Allegation	<p>November 18th 2016: Tal Afar, Nineveh Province, Iraq Summary: Dozens of civilians were killed or wounded in Tal Afar due to airstrikes and shelling, according to many local sources. Yaqein reported that "scores of unarmed civilians" were killed by Coalition strikes as well as selling by government-aligned militias. A source told Yaqein that "Tal Afar hospital is currently teeming with dozens of people injured due to indiscriminate shelling of the [Coalition] alliance and militia." Several other outlets, including News of Iraq reported both airstrikes as well as shelling from Popular Mobilization units. Al Jazeera said that "dozens of civilians" were killed or wounded, but also reported that the Iraqi Defense Ministry said that the Iraqi Air Force was involved in bombing raids. Fursan al Malhama noted fighting in the area involving government aligned militias, and claimed that 15 militia members had been killed. Civilians reported killed: 2 or more Civilians reported injured: 2 or more Sources: Yaqein [Arabic] [Archived], Al Jazeera [Arabic] [Archived], News of Iraq [Arabic] [Archived], From Iraq [Arabic] [Archived], Islam Agenda, [Arabic] [Archived], Iraq Spring Media Center [Arabic] [Archived] Fursan al Malhama [Arabic] [Archived] Quality of Reporting: Contested</p>		
Analysis	<p>1. Is this allegation a self-report? NO If yes, add details of corroborating strike below and task a CCAR. If no, move to 2.</p> <p>2. Does the allegation include a) video/photo evidence of CIVCAS NO b) a general location, e.g., Tabaqah, Manbij, Tel Afar; if in Mosul, or similarly sized city, must provide neighborhoods, e.g., Zanjili. Tal Afar AND c) a way to identify the date or a 48 hour date range? 18 NOV 2016 If yes to all three, move to 6. If any are no, then move to number 3.</p> <p>3. Does the allegation contain a a) General Day, YES AND</p>		

	<p>b) Specific location, e.g., MGRS or specific building? NO</p> <p>If yes to the two, then move to 6. If any are no, move to number 4.</p> <p>4.a. Is the allegation from a single source (even if there are multiple sources, look at whether the sources lack independence, i.e., all derived from one source)? NO. If yes, move to 4.b. If no, move to 5.</p> <p>4.b. Is the single source a high quality source OR does it provide specific facts that may warrant a CCAR. If yes, move to 6. If no, then move to 4.c.</p> <p>4.c. Has media interviewed witnesses and/or victims? If yes, then contact journalist and re-assess. If no, then close the allegation.</p> <p>5.a. Are any of the sources high quality? YES. If yes, move to 6. If no, move to 5.b.</p> <p>5.b. Are there at least two corroborating sources (total of 3) that independently reported the allegation, OR does it provide specific facts that may warrant a CCAR? If yes, move to 6. If no, close the allegation.</p> <p>6. Does the allegation contain sufficient information on the time, location and details to make an assessment of credibility? Marginally. Reports are of indiscriminate shelling as well as airstrikes. Grid from Airwars was to center of Tal Afar and not specific to a location of suspected strike(s). I.e., does it provide enough information to determine the date within 48 hour; does it provide enough information to determine a neighborhood, landmark, or other way to where the alleged incident occurred within a .5km radius? If yes, move to 7. If no, close the allegation.</p> <p>7. Are there any potentially corroborating strikes? If yes, answer the below questions and task CCAR. If no, close allegation. No strikes IVO Tal Afar between 16-18 NOV 2016. Ref "allegation739 NOV16.ppt".</p> <p>1. Assessed date of incident: 18 NOV 2016.</p> <p>2. Location: Tal Afar, Iraq</p> <p>3. Corroborating strikes: none.</p>
Non-US Coalition Involvement	
Decision	Close at IA; insufficient evidence to corroborate the allegation.
Report Approved By:	(b)(3) 10 USC 130b; (b)(5)

Page 149 redacted for the following reason:

Exhibits removed per agreement - Bates Number 3945

Approved for Release