

## CIVCAS CELL INITIAL ASSESSMENT

Allegation #	776		
Source(s)	AIRWARS	Date Received	23 JUN 2017
Casualty Estimate	13-20 killed ; 8 injured		
Incident Date	9 DEC 2016		
Location	Al Bab, Aleppo governorate, Syria (IVO MGRS: (b)(1)1.4a)		
Allegation	<p><b>December 9th 2016: باب Al Bab, Aleppo governorate, Syria</b></p> <p><b>Synopsis:</b> : At least thirteen civilians were reported killed and eight injured in either a Turkish or Coalition airstrike on al Bab. The Coalition later denied responsibility. Al Jazeera citing ISIL said two families were among 13 dead civilians after multiple "Turkish airstrikes" on the city. The Syrian Observatory said that "no less than 12 civilians from three families were killed while others were wounded by Turkish airstrikes and bombardment by Turkish forces and al-Furat Shield forces targeted al-Bab city which is taken over by IS, including a man with his wife and 3 of their children in addition to another man from the same family, with his wife and 2 of their children, in addition to 2 children with their mom, the number of the dead is likely to rise." Shaam News placed the death toll at 20.</p> <p>Almost all sources blamed Turkey. However LCCSY (which has claimed Turkey is not killing civilians in its actions in northern Syria) said the US-led Coalition was responsible. The Syrian Network also blamed the Coalition.</p> <p>Halaab News (which blamed the Coalition) named the following civilian victims:</p> <p>Abd al Rahman Na'ssani and his wife  Sidra Abd al Rahman Na'ssani – child  Anas Abd al Rahman Na'ssani – child  Sidal Abd al Rahman Na'ssani – child  Malek Na'ssani and his wife  Shahida Malik Na'ssani – child  Al Zafra Nour Malik Na'ssani  Mohammad Hamad – child  Foad Ahmad – child  Fatima al Nako  An unidentified child</p> <p>In an emailed response to a report submitted by Airwars on this and other incidents in December 2016, Coalition officials said the event was presently assessed as 'Not credible.'</p> <p>Civilians reported killed: 13-20, including 7 children and 3 women  Civilians reported injured: 8</p> <p>Sources: Russia Today [Arabic] [Archived], Al Jazeera (1) [Arabic] [Archived], Al Jazeera (2) [Arabic] [Archived], Enab Baladi [Arabic] [Archived], Al Jisr TV [Arabic] [Archived], Al A' Amaq (1) (ISIL linked) [Arabic] [Archived], Al A' Amaq (2) (ISIL linked) [Arabic] [Archived], Al</p>		

	<p>A' Amaq (3) (ISIL linked) [Arabic] [Archived], Syrian Observatory for Human Rights [Archived], LCCSY [Arabic] [Archived], Shaam News Network [Arabic] [Archived], Syria News Desk [Arabic] [Archived], Syrian PC [Arabic] [Archived], Syrian Network for Human Rights [Archived], Halab News – victim list [Arabic] [Archived],</p> <p>Quality of reporting: Discounted Coalition – most likely Turkey. ASSESSED INCIDENT</p> <p>Coalition position: For December 8th-9th 2016, the Coalition publicly reported no strikes in Aleppo governorate.</p> <p>For December 9th-10th it stated: “Near Manbij, one strike destroyed an ISIL headquarters building.”</p> <p><b>Quality of Reporting: Discounted Coalition</b></p>
<p><b>Analysis</b></p>	<p>1. Is this allegation a self-report? <b>NO</b> If yes, add details of corroborating strike below and task a CCAR. If no, move to 2.</p> <p>2. Does the allegation include</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a) video/photo evidence of CIVCAS <b>NO</b></li> <li>b) a general location, e.g., Tabaqah, Manbij, Tel Afar; if in Mosul, or similarly sized city, must provide neighborhoods, e.g., Zanjili. <b>Al Bab, Aleppo, Syria</b></li> <li>AND</li> <li>c) a way to identify the date or a 48 hour date range? <b>9 DEC 2016</b></li> </ul> <p>If yes to all three, move to 6. If any are no, then move to number 3.</p> <p>3. Does the allegation contain a</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a) General Day, <b>YES</b></li> <li>AND</li> <li>b) Specific location, e.g., MGRS or specific building? <b>NO</b></li> </ul> <p>If yes to the two, then move to 6. If any are no, move to number 4.</p> <p>4.a. Is the allegation from a single source <b>NO</b> (even if there are multiple sources, look at whether the sources lack independence, i.e., all derived from one source)? If yes, move to 4.b. If no, move to 5.</p> <p>4.b. Is the single source a high quality source <b>OR</b> does it provide specific facts that may warrant a CCAR. If yes, move to 6. If no, then move to 4.c.</p> <p>4.c. Has media interviewed witnesses and/or victims? If yes, then contact journalist and re-assess. If no, then close the allegation.</p> <p>5. Are any of the sources high quality? <b>YES</b> If yes, move to 6. If no, move to 5.b.</p> <p>5.b. Are there at least two corroborating sources (total of 3) that independently reported the allegation, <b>OR</b> does it provide specific facts that may warrant a CCAR? If yes, move to 6. If no, close the allegation.</p> <p>6. Does the allegation contain sufficient information on the time, location and details to make an assessment of credibility? <b>YES</b></p> <p>I.e., does it provide enough information to determine the date within 48 hour; does it provide enough information to determine a neighborhood, landmark, or other way to where</p>



	<p>the alleged incident occurred within a .5km radius? <b>NO</b> If yes, move to 7. If no, close the allegation.</p> <p>7. Are there any potentially corroborating strikes? <b>NO. See screen shot.</b> If yes, answer the below questions and task CCAR. If no, close allegation.</p>
<b>Non-US Coalition Involvement</b>	<b>Turkish Airstrikes</b>
<b>Decision</b>	<b>Close Allegation – assess as Turkish airstrike</b>
<b>Report Approved By:</b>	<div>(b)(3) 10 USC 130b; (b)(6)</div>

Page 228 redacted for the following reason:

-----  
Exhibits removed per agreement - Bates Number 4024

Approved for Release