



DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE
COMBINED JOINT FORCE LAND COMPONENT COMMAND - OPERATION INHERENT RESOLVE
UNION III, BAGHDAD
APO AE 09348

IRIZ-JA

29 November 2016

MEMORANDUM FOR CIVCAS Team, Combined Joint Task Force- Operation Inherent Resolve, APO, AE 09306

SUBJECT: CIVCAS Credibility Assessment Report (CCAR) for alleged civilian casualties in Qarakosh and Hasan by Russian media, occurring during the period 22 - 24 Oct 16

1. BLUF: A Russian media source reported that "massive bombings" were conducted by Coalition air assets destroying civilian infrastructure in the districts of Qarakosh and Hasan occupied by non-combatants on 23 Oct 16. This report is assessed to be not credible based upon an absence of information relating to this incident. Specifically, there is no further reporting, Government of Iraq (GoI) or Iraqi Security Forces (ISF) knowledge of any civilian casualties, or subsequent intelligence or open source reporting relating to this allegation, and no specificity relating to this general allegation.
2. CIVCAS Allegation:
 - a. Source: CJTF-OIR provided the Russian Media Outlet reporting of 25 Oct 16, disseminating a statement made by the Chief of the Main Operations Directorate of the Russian DOD, Lieutenant General Sergey Rudskoy.
 - b. Time and Location: The allegation relates to 23 Oct 2016, in southern Mosul.
 - c. Description: Lieutenant General Rudskoy accused the U.S. of conducting "massive bombings" that were allegedly carried out on the 23 OCT and destroyed civilian infrastructure in districts of Qarakosh and Hasana occupied by non-combatants.
3. Analysis: The allegation is assessed to be not credible based on an analysis of the CJTF-OIR strikes conducted during this period; the historic reporting relating to the area in question and the absence of further detail to support the general nature of allegations made by Rudskoy.
 - a. Coalition Strike Activity: There were multiple strikes conducted IVO Mosul on 22 Oct 16. There were approximately (1) engagements conducted on 22 Oct 16 IVO Qarakosh. There were no recorded engagements IVO Qarakosh on 23 Oct 16. However, when analyzing where these engagements plot, only (1) engagements

IRIZ-JA

SUBJECT: CIVCAS Credibility Assessment Report (CCAR) for alleged civilian casualties in Qara Kosh and Hasan by Russian media, occurring during the period 22 - 24 Oct 16

related to previously residential facilities IVO the Qarakosh area, conducted in one strike on 22 Oct 16. The details of these engagement are as follows:

1. CJTF-OIR Strike number (b)(1)1.4a
2. Strike (b)(1)1.4a correlates to CJFLCC-OIR Strike (b)(1)1.4a.
3. The targets of these engagements are listed as:
 - a. Armed PAX (Eng # (b)(1)1.4a); (b)(1)1.4a;
 - b. Assembly Area (Eng # (b)(1)1.4a);
 - c. Mortar Tube (Eng # (b)(1)1.4a);
 - d. Pax with Mortar (Eng # (b)(1)1.4a);
 - e. Armored Vehicle (Eng # (b)(1)1.4a);
 - f. Weapons Cache (Eng # (b)(1)1.4a);
 - g. Tunnels (Eng # (b)(1)1.4a);
 - h. VBIED (Eng # (b)(1)1.4a);
 - i. Front End Loader (Eng # (b)(1)1.4a);
 - j. Direct Fire Position (Eng # (b)(1)1.4a);
 - k. Mortar Point of Origin (Eng # (b)(1)1.4a);
 - l. UAV Team (Eng # (b)(1)1.4a);
 - m. HMG Fire (Eng # (b)(1)1.4a);
 - n. Mobile C2 vehicle (Eng # (b)(1)1.4a);
 - o. Artillery Piece (Eng # (b)(1)1.4a);
 - p. Bunker (Eng # (b)(1)1.4a);
 - q. Recoilless Rifle (Eng # (b)(1)1.4a);
 - r. Sniper Position (Eng # (b)(1)1.4a);
 - s. DSHK. RPG Position (Eng # (b)(1)1.4a);
 - t. Suppression fire (Eng # (b)(1)1.4a); and
 - u. Trench network (Eng # (b)(1)1.4a);
 - v. See Excerpt of CJOC-E strike log, at Enclosure 1.
4. Amongst other enemy objectives, the BDA recorded '5 x buildings destroyed'.
5. Plotting these engagements on Google Earth corroborates this BDA as being only five buildings (see Enclosure 2).
6. There were no observations nor reports from any ISR assets regarding possible civilian casualties tied to any of these engagements.

b. Additional Information:

IRIZ-JA

SUBJECT: CIVCAS Credibility Assessment Report (CCAR) for alleged civilian casualties in Qara Kosh and Hasan by Russian media, occurring during the period 22 - 24 Oct 16

1. The area in question has been one that has high enemy activity, with no observed civilian pattern of life over an extended period of time. Specifically, the village of Hamdaniyah (also known as Qarakosh) has had its (b)(1)1.4a protections removed since 03 Jul 16. This removal was based on an assessment that the area was exclusively used by Da'esh as a military objective. Enclosure 3 contains the (b)(1)1.4a removal packet supporting this removal during the period in question, outlining the period of observation of the village and the absence of civilians supporting the assessment of exclusive military use.
2. There has been no intelligence reporting, no Information Operations reporting, no Iraqi Security Forces reporting, War Media Cell reporting or open source media information that supports there were any civilian casualties IVO Qarakosh or Hasan during the period 22 - 24 Oct 16.
3. There is insufficient information to corroborate this allegation and insufficient information to make an assessment of credibility, therefore, per para 2.b.(3) of CJTF-OIR'S CIVCAS SOP, issued on 15 Nov 16, this allegation is deemed to be not credible.
4. The CJTF-OIR CIVCAS team noted that as this allegation was made by the Russian Ministry of Defense through local Russian media, a credibility assessment was necessary. However, the information provided in the same Russian CIVCAS allegation relating to another, more significant, incident (allegedly killing 60 school children and injuring a further 200) was deemed not credible and assessed as baseless. The source of this overall report is not deemed to be reliable by CJFLCC-OIR.

4. Credibility Assessment: Based on a thorough assessment of all reasonably available evidence, this CIVCAS allegation is deemed not credible. That is, it is more likely than not that the CIVCAS incident did not occur. This assessment is based upon the absence of corroborative reporting, the likely veracity of the original report, and the absence of any supporting reporting for what would be a significant incident, had this CIVCAS incident occurred as alleged.

5. (U) The point of contact for this memorandum is (b)(3) 10 USC 130b; (b)(6) on (b)(3) 10 USC 130b; (b)(6).

(b)(3) 10 USC 130b; (b)(6)

Encls:

1. 22 Oct 16 CJOC-E Strike Log Excerpt

(b)(3) 10 USC 130b; (b)(6)

IRIZ-JA

SUBJECT: CIVCAS Credibility Assessment Report (CCAR) for alleged civilian casualties in Qara Kosh and Hasan by Russian media, occurring during the period 22 - 24 Oct 16

2. GoogleEarth plot of Strike (b)(1)1.4a
3. (b)(1)1.4a removal packet – Hamdaniyah (Kara Qosh)

IRIZ-JA

SUBJECT: CIVCAS Credibility Assessment Report (CCAR) for alleged civilian casualties in Qara Kosh and Hasan by Russian media, occurring during the period 22 - 24 Oct 16

I have conducted a legal review of the information contained in this CCAR and the supporting evidence. Based upon all reasonably available information at this time, I find that:

1.

(b)(5)

(b)(3) 10 USC 130b; (b)(6)

NOV 29 2016

IRIZ-JA

SUBJECT: CIVCAS Credibility Assessment Report (CCAR) for alleged civilian casualties in Qara Kosh and Hasan by Russian media, occurring during the period 22 - 24 Oct 16

I have reviewed the information contained in this CCAR and the supporting evidence. Based upon all reasonably available information at this time, I find that:

The evidence supports a finding of CREDIBLE. That is, it is more likely than not that the CIVCAS incident occurred. I direct an investigation be conducted by this command.

The evidence supports a finding of CREDIBLE. That is, it is more likely than not that the CIVCAS incident occurred. However, at this time I direct no investigation be conducted by this command, as no additional information could be discovered by further investigation.

The evidence supports a finding of NOT CREDIBLE. Without additional evidence, I direct that no further action be taken by this command.


JOSEPH M. MARTIN
Major General, USA
CG/CJFLCC-OIR